

## Aggregate Confusion: The Challenge of ESG Ratings

### Authors



Vishal Hindocha, CFA  
Senior Managing Director  
Global Head of Investment Solutions



Bess Joffe  
Managing Director  
Global Head of Client  
Sustainability Strategy

### In brief

- The ambiguity around ESG ratings represents a major challenge for investors.
- The ways in which investors evaluate a company's sustainability are under increasing scrutiny.
- With heightened public interest and an evolving regulatory landscape, there has never been a greater demand for high-quality data collection, analysis and disclosure.
- Different rating agencies can produce inconsistent and subjective results made worse by company-provided information of unreliable quality.
- Investors, creditors, insurers and asset managers need to work with academics and other stakeholders to better understand how ESG impacts performance metrics.
- We believe ESG is part of the investment process rather than something separate. It drives sound business and highlights issues that could materially impact a company's long-term viability.

### Apples to oranges: ESG scores and ratings

Rating agencies vary wildly in their comparative analyses and differ on the indicators used to determine ESG scores. As asset managers, we find ourselves comparing apples to oranges when analyzing sustainability data — not a good process for us or our clients.

In 2021, MFS® was [one of four founding members](#) of MIT Sloan School of Management's Aggregate Confusion Project, an initiative to improve ESG measurement in the financial sector. Together, we are tackling the ESG measurement challenge and developing methodologies for a more rigorous and reliable integration of these indicators. Professor Roberto Rigobon, the Society of Sloan Fellows Professor of Management and Professor of Applied Economics at MIT Sloan, said, "The challenges they're addressing in using ESG data will help guide our research and the implementation of new ESG measurement techniques we develop together."

The professor said this work builds on his research paper "[Aggregate Confusion: The Divergence of ESG Ratings](#)," coauthored with MIT Research Fellow Florian Berg. It found "the correlation among prominent agencies' ESG ratings was on average 0.54; by comparison, credit ratings from Moody's and Standard and Poor's are correlated at 0.92." At an MFS event, Professor Rigobon said, "What we did was convince the rating agencies to give us their real data. Not only did they give us access to the data, but they also gave us access to the analysts, so we interviewed people."

The original "Aggregate Confusion" research cites measurement divergence (56%), scope divergence (38%) and weight divergence (6%) as the drivers of the overall discrepancy. Professor George Serafeim, the Charles M. Williams Professor of Business Administration at Harvard Business School, wrote a paper, "[ESG: From Process to Product](#)," that argues that the integration of ESG is an ongoing process undertaken by stakeholders to measure, analyze, manage and communicate outcomes. Unfortunately, some have commoditized ESG investing, turning a process into a product. We wish it were that simple. It's time for the industry to address this challenge. So, what are some solutions? We believe an active approach like MFS' — integrating



the consideration of material ESG factors into the investment process — is one. In fact, we consider all material factors, financial and nonfinancial, relying mostly on our in-house research to understand a company's long-term potential.

### The need for expertise

It is necessary to delegate the analysis of ESG factors to experts. However, the aggregation of data has led to compromised ratings that ignore nuance. Professor Serafeim, who co-leads the Climate and Sustainability Impact Lab in the Digital, Data and Design Institute, argues that the evolution of ESG from process to product has caused confusion. Rating agencies may use different metrics and methodologies, focus on distinct aspects or weigh certain aspects more heavily than others. The demand for frameworks defining the objectives and characteristics of ESG investment products is growing as a result.

When investing, our goal is to be value makers. As we have explained in our paper [“A Constructivist Approach to Sustainability,”](#) the prevailing wisdom is that stewardship decisions are binary: You are either an activist or passive. We don't agree. Constructive stewardship is about collaboration and understanding. We believe it gives us an analytic advantage and can be a source of alpha generation.

As with other sustainability challenges, our optimal approach to ESG is relying on our own tools: dialogue with companies, thoughtful proxy voting, bilateral engagement and investor collaboration. Faced with the ESG ratings challenge, institutional investors must improve their understanding and their assessment of investment managers, holding them to account for how they are integrating sustainability into the investment process.

The industry needs to take a step back and reflect. ESG issues are complex, and we can't simply rely on simple single-number scores or solutions. Professor Rigobon spoke last November: “If I give you 100 statistics, I think it will be too overwhelming for you to make a decision about which firm you should invest in. The problem that the ratings agencies are trying to solve is extremely difficult. The only solution we have is human beings. We need to delegate the measurement and aggregation to someone who pays attention to all these issues like labor treatment, electromagnetic field pollution and online marketing product safety. I cannot imagine that any one person will be an expert on all things.”

For MFS, the solution is to have strong relationships and regular dialogue with the companies in which we invest. It is about highly collaborative, long-term and persistent engagement, always benefiting from our thorough understanding of each company. We continue to collaborate with clients, academics, investee companies and other stakeholders to help the industry better understand how to integrate ESG.

**To learn more about how sustainable investing works at MFS, please visit [mfs.com/sustainability](https://mfs.com/sustainability) or contact your MFS representative.**

Read more on this topic in our paper [“A Constructivist Approach to Sustainability.”](#)

### Sources

<https://www.prnewswire.com/news-releases/mit-sloans-aggregate-confusion-project-an-initiative-to-improve-esg-measurement-in-the-financial-sector-welcomes-four-new-investment-firms-as-founding-members-301408334.html>

[https://papers.ssrn.com/sol3/papers.cfm?abstract\\_id=3438533](https://papers.ssrn.com/sol3/papers.cfm?abstract_id=3438533)

[https://www.hbs.edu/ris/Publication%20Files/23-069\\_c3b42539-b1f3-4acf-a7d7-60e85806f96d.pdf](https://www.hbs.edu/ris/Publication%20Files/23-069_c3b42539-b1f3-4acf-a7d7-60e85806f96d.pdf)

<https://www.mfs.com/en-us/investment-professional/insights/sustainability/a-constructivist-approach-to-sustainability.html>



The views expressed are those of the author(s) and are subject to change at any time. These views are for informational purposes only and should not be relied upon as a recommendation to purchase any security or as a solicitation or investment advice. No forecasts can be guaranteed.

MFS may incorporate environmental, social, or governance (ESG) factors into its investment decision making, fundamental investment analysis and engagement activities when communicating with issuers. The degree to which MFS incorporates ESG factors into its investment decision making, investment analysis and/or engagement activities will vary by strategy, product, and asset class, and may also vary over time, and will generally be determined based on MFS' opinion of the relevance and materiality of the specific ESG factors (which may differ from judgements or opinions of third-parties, including investors). Any ESG assessments or incorporation of ESG factors by MFS may be reliant on data received from third-parties (including investee companies and ESG data vendors), which may be inaccurate, incomplete, inconsistent, out-of-date or estimated, or only consider certain ESG aspects (rather than looking at the entire sustainability profile and actions of an investment or its value chain), and as such, may adversely impact MFS' analysis of the ESG factors relevant to an investment.

### GLOBAL DISCLOSURE

Unless otherwise indicated, logos and product and service names are trademarks of MFS® and its affiliates and may be registered in certain countries.

Distributed by: **U.S.** - MFS Investment Management; **Latin America** - MFS International Ltd.

**Please note that in Europe and Asia Pacific, this document is intended for distribution to investment professionals and institutional use only. In Canada, this document is intended for distribution to institutional clients only.**

**Note to readers in Canada:** Issued in Canada by MFS Investment Management Canada Limited. **Note to UK and Switzerland readers:** Issued in the UK and Switzerland by MFS International (U.K.) Limited ("MIL UK"), a private limited company registered in England and Wales with the company number 03062718, and authorised and regulated in the conduct of investment business by the UK Financial Conduct Authority. MIL UK, an indirect subsidiary of MFS®, has its registered office at One Carter Lane, London, EC4V 5ER. **Note to Europe (ex UK and Switzerland) readers:** Issued in Europe by MFS Investment Management (Lux) S.à r.l. (MFS Lux) – authorized under Luxembourg law as a management company for Funds domiciled in Luxembourg and which both provide products and investment services to institutional investors and is registered office is at S.a r.l. 4 Rue Albert Borschette, Luxembourg L-1246. Tel: 352 2826 12800. This material shall not be circulated or distributed to any person other than to professional investors (as permitted by local regulations) and should not be relied upon or distributed to persons where such reliance or distribution would be contrary to local regulation; **Singapore** - MFS International Singapore Pte. Ltd. (CRN 201228809M); **Australia/New Zealand** - MFS International Australia Pty Ltd ("MFS Australia") (ABN 68 607 579 537) holds an Australian financial services licence number 485343. MFS Australia is regulated by the Australian Securities and Investments Commission.; **Hong Kong** - MFS International (Hong Kong) Limited ("MIL HK"), a private limited company licensed and regulated by the Hong Kong Securities and Futures Commission (the "SFC"). MIL HK is approved to engage in dealing in securities and asset management regulated activities and may provide certain investment services to "professional investors" as defined in the Securities and Futures Ordinance ("SFO"); **For Professional Investors in China** - MFS Financial Management Consulting (Shanghai) Co., Ltd. 2801-12, 28th Floor, 100 Century Avenue, Shanghai World Financial Center, Shanghai Pilot Free Trade Zone, 200120, China, a Chinese limited liability company registered to provide financial management consulting services.; **Japan** - MFS Investment Management K.K., is registered as a Financial Instruments Business Operator, Kanto Local Finance Bureau (FIBO) No.312, a member of the Investment Trust Association, Japan and the Japan Investment Advisers Association. As fees to be borne by investors vary depending upon circumstances such as products, services, investment period and market conditions, the total amount nor the calculation methods cannot be disclosed in advance. All investments involve risks, including market fluctuation and investors may lose the principal amount invested. Investors should obtain and read the prospectus and/or document set forth in Article 37-3 of Financial Instruments and Exchange Act carefully before making the investments; **Bahrain** - This document has not been approved by the Central Bank of Bahrain which takes no responsibility for its contents. No offer to the public will be made in the Kingdom of Bahrain and this document is intended to be read by the addressee only and must not be passed to, issued to, or shown to the public generally. The Central Bank of Bahrain assumes no responsibility for the accuracy and completeness of the statements and information contained in this document and expressly disclaims any liability whatsoever for any loss howsoever arising from reliance upon the whole or any part of the contents of this document. The Board of Directors and the management of the issuer accepts responsibility for the information contained in this document. To the best of the knowledge and belief of the board of directors and the management, who have all taken all reasonable care to ensure that such is the case, the information contained in this document is in accordance with the facts and does not omit anything likely to affect the reliability of such information.; **Kuwait** - This document is not for general circulation to the public in Kuwait. The information has not been licensed for offering in Kuwait by the Kuwait Capital Markets Authority or any other relevant Kuwaiti government agency. No private or public offering of the information is being made in Kuwait, and no agreement relating to the information will be concluded in Kuwait. No marketing or solicitation or inducement activities are being used to offer or market the information in Kuwait.; **Oman** - For Residents of the Sultanate of Oman: The information contained in this document does not constitute a public offer of securities in the Sultanate of Oman as contemplated by the Commercial Companies Law of Oman (Royal Decree 4/74) or the Capital Market Law of Oman (Royal Decree 80/98). This information is being circulated on a limited basis only to corporate entities that fall within the description of sophisticated investors (Article 139 of the Executive Regulations of the Capital Market Law). The recipient acknowledges that they are a sophisticated investor who has experience in business and financial matters and is capable of evaluating the merits and risks on an investment.; **South Africa** - This document, and the information contained is not intended and does not constitute, a public offer of securities in South Africa and accordingly should not be construed as such. This document is not for general circulation to the public in South Africa. This document has not been approved by the Financial Sector Conduct Authority and neither MFS International (U.K.) Limited nor its funds are registered for public sale in South Africa.; **UAE** - This document, and the information contained herein, does not constitute, and is not intended to constitute, a public offer of securities in the United Arab Emirates and accordingly should not be construed as such. The information is only being offered to a limited number of exempt investors in the UAE who fall under one of the following categories of non-natural Qualified Investors: (1) an investor which is able to manage its investments on its own, namely: (a) the federal government, local governments, government entities and authorities or companies wholly owned by any such entities; (b) international entities and organisations; or (c) a person licensed to carry out a commercial activity in the UAE, provided that investment is one of the objects of such person; or (2) an investor who is represented by an investment manager licensed by the SCA, (each a "non-natural Qualified Investor"). The information and data have not been approved by or licensed or registered with the UAE Central Bank, the Securities and Commodities Authority, the Dubai Financial Services Authority, the Financial Services Regulatory Authority or any other relevant licensing authorities or governmental agencies in the UAE (the "Authorities"). The Authorities assume no liability for any investment that the named addressee makes as a non-natural Qualified Investor diligence on the accuracy of the information relating to the securities. If you do not understand the contents of this document you should consult an authorised financial adviser.; **Saudi Arabia** - This document may not be distributed in the Kingdom except to such persons as are permitted under the Investment Funds Regulations issued by the Capital Market Authority. The Capital Market Authority does not make any representation as to the accuracy or completeness of this document, and expressly disclaims any liability whatsoever for any loss arising from, or incurred in reliance upon, any part of this document. Prospective purchasers of the securities offered hereby should conduct their own due diligence on the accuracy of the information relating to the securities. If you do not understand the contents of this document, you should consult an authorised financial adviser.; **Qatar** - This material/fund is only being offered to a limited number of investors who are willing and able to conduct an independent investigation of the risks involved in an investment in such material/fund. The material does not constitute an offer to the public and is for the use only of the named addressee and should not be given or shown to any other person (other than employees, agents or consultants in connection with the addressee's consideration thereof). The fund has not been and will not be registered with the Qatar Central Bank or under any laws of the State of Qatar. No transaction will be concluded in your jurisdiction and any inquiries regarding the material/fund should be made to your contact outside Qatar.