

## Indexing Dilutes Capitalism

### Author



Robert M. Almeida, Jr.  
Portfolio Manager and  
Global Investment Strategist

### In brief

- While capitalism has its downsides, no system allocates resources better.
- The result is a complex and adaptive economy.
- But indexing has amplified the disconnect between valuations and fundamentals.

While every economic system has its drawbacks, capitalism, since its inception several hundred years ago, has outperformed the alternatives. While many have been left behind at various points in time, capitalism has demonstrated its merit in allocating society's resources better than the decisions of a collective few.

But capitalism's edge in efficiency doesn't come without costs. One of its downsides is the unpredictable nature of business cycles. It seems to me that before the first quarter ends each year, most economic and financial market forecasts produced at the end of the prior year end up in the recycling bin as forecasters react to new and differing circumstances.

While this is one of the prices paid for living in a market-based system for allocating resources, why does it happen? And more importantly, what can we learn from it and why is it relevant?

### A complex and adaptive system

While predicting rational decisions is possible, it's the unexpected or surprising decisions of some and the subsequent effects on the many that typically upend economic and financial market predictions.

Capitalism requires unsuppressed price signals for resources to be allocated efficiently. Those signals help create equilibrium between natural market forces, specifically supply and demand, for everything from the price of gum to the price of automobiles, to borrowing costs, to stock and bond prices. Society, from consumers, to business owners, to investors, is constantly altering its behavior based on changes in prices.

Economists would call this a complex and adaptive system. It's complex because hundreds of millions of people make dozens of choices a day. It's adaptive because changes in prices lead to changes in behavior. More interestingly, given humans have emotions and subconscious biases, sometimes our choices are made simply based upon the behavior of others, influencing what may have otherwise been a rational decision. The combination of capitalism's complexity and adaptiveness often leads to radical and surprising outcomes.



### Relevance for today

The policy response by global policymakers to the global financial crisis in 2008 was to reduce interest rates and inject capital into financial institutions. Rates were suppressed to historically unnatural levels for over a decade as money velocity fell and deflation risks mounted. None of this is new to you.

However, it's important to remember that interest rates represent the price of time and the cost of capital. Rates are the first hurdle that must be cleared in every capital allocation decision. Yet their price was not a function of natural supply and demand.

Years of interest rate disequilibrium blunted capitalism's price discovery process. But while we've yet to realize overdue corrections in the economy and financial markets, that doesn't mean we won't.

The socialization of capital losses in the post-GFC period beautifully paved the pathway for the massive growth of indexation. Investors are willing to pay a fee for the prospect of active managers limiting their downside but they see no reason to do so when central bankers do the job for them.

That probably reads like a whiny, biased perspective from an active manager who's lost share to passive vehicles. Fair enough. However, with passive vehicles today representing over half of investable assets and the bulk of incremental investment capital, inefficiencies continue to grow.

When unencumbered by suppressed interest rates, financial markets push money toward enterprises with the highest risk-adjusted return on capital prospects and pull it from the weakest. This is Wall Street's version of natural selection, and it's capitalism at work.

But that isn't what's happening today. A lot of capital is being allocated based on market cap rather than on which opportunities may offer the best risk-adjusted returns. Indexing is momentum investing, accelerating the accrued financial market and economic inefficiencies leftover from the 2010s and pandemic-led stimulus.

Yes, some of the largest index constituents are high-returning businesses. But that doesn't mean they aren't wildly overvalued due to the new plumbing of finance and the growing disconnect between price and fundamentals. Perhaps more importantly, many of the companies attracting the most capital may face a significant risk of obsolescence from artificial intelligence.

### Conclusion

Our capitalist system has proven the most efficient means of resource distribution. However, it requires untrammelled market forces to deliver correct price signals. When those signals are distorted, it creates problems.

Humans sometimes make irrational decisions, and as business cycles age, people tend to make more of them as they seek to get rich quick. It's important to consider that factor when managing other peoples' wealth. ▲



The views expressed are those of the author(s) and are subject to change at any time. These views are for informational purposes only and should not be relied upon as a recommendation to purchase any security or as a solicitation or investment advice. No forecasts can be guaranteed.

Unless otherwise indicated, logos and product and service names are trademarks of MFS® and its affiliates and may be registered in certain countries.

Distributed by: **U.S.** - MFS Investment Management; **Latin America** - MFS International Ltd.

**Please note that in Europe and Asia Pacific, this document is intended for distribution to investment professionals and institutional use only. In Canada, this document is intended for distribution to institutional clients only.**

**Note to readers in Canada:** Issued in Canada by MFS Investment Management Canada Limited. **Note to UK and Switzerland readers:** Issued in the UK and Switzerland by MFS International (U.K.) Limited ("MIL UK"), a private limited company registered in England and Wales with the company number 03062718, and authorised and regulated in the conduct of investment business by the UK Financial Conduct Authority. MIL UK, an indirect subsidiary of MFS®, has its registered office at One Carter Lane, London, EC4V 5ER. **Note to Europe (ex UK and Switzerland) readers:** Issued in Europe by MFS Investment Management (Lux) S.à r.l. (MFS Lux) – authorized under Luxembourg law as a management company for Funds domiciled in Luxembourg and which both provide products and investment services to institutional investors and is registered office is at S.a r.l. 4 Rue Albert Borschette, Luxembourg L-1246. Tel: 352 2826 12800. This material shall not be circulated or distributed to any person other than to professional investors (as permitted by local regulations) and should not be relied upon or distributed to persons where such reliance or distribution would be contrary to local regulation; **Singapore** - MFS International Singapore Pte. Ltd. (CRN 201228809M); **Australia/New Zealand** - MFS International Australia Pty Ltd ("MFS Australia") (ABN 68 607 579 537) holds an Australian financial services licence number 485343. MFS Australia is regulated by the Australian Securities and Investments Commission.; **Hong Kong** - MFS International (Hong Kong) Limited ("MIL HK"), a private limited company licensed and regulated by the Hong Kong Securities and Futures Commission (the "SFC"). MIL HK is approved to engage in dealing in securities and asset management regulated activities and may provide certain investment services to "professional investors" as defined in the Securities and Futures Ordinance ("SFO"); **For Professional Investors in China** – MFS Financial Management Consulting (Shanghai) Co., Ltd. 2801-12, 28th Floor, 100 Century Avenue, Shanghai World Financial Center, Shanghai Pilot Free Trade Zone, 200120, China, a Chinese limited liability company registered to provide financial management consulting services.; **Japan** - MFS Investment Management K.K., is registered as a Financial Instruments Business Operator, Kanto Local Finance Bureau (FIBO) No.312, a member of the Investment Trust Association, Japan and the Japan Investment Advisers Association. As fees to be borne by investors vary depending upon circumstances such as products, services, investment period and market conditions, the total amount nor the calculation methods cannot be disclosed in advance. All investments involve risks, including market fluctuation and investors may lose the principal amount invested. Investors should obtain and read the prospectus and/or document set forth in Article 37-3 of Financial Instruments and Exchange Act carefully before making the investments; **Bahrain** - This document has not been approved by the Central Bank of Bahrain which takes no responsibility for its contents. No offer to the public will be made in the Kingdom of Bahrain and this document is intended to be read by the addressee only and must not be passed to, issued to, or shown to the public generally. The Central Bank of Bahrain assumes no responsibility for the accuracy and completeness of the statements and information contained in this document and expressly disclaims any liability whatsoever for any loss howsoever arising from reliance upon the whole or any part of the contents of this document. The Board of Directors and the management of the issuer accepts responsibility for the information contained in this document. To the best of the knowledge and belief of the board of directors and the management, who have all taken all reasonable care to ensure that such is the case, the information contained in this document is in accordance with the facts and does not omit anything likely to affect the reliability of such information.; **Kuwait** - This document is not for general circulation to the public in Kuwait. The information has not been licensed for offering in Kuwait by the Kuwait Capital Markets Authority or any other relevant Kuwaiti government agency. No private or public offering of the information is being made in Kuwait, and no agreement relating to the information will be concluded in Kuwait. No marketing or solicitation or inducement activities are being used to offer or market the information in Kuwait.; **Oman** - For Residents of the Sultanate of Oman: The information contained in this document does not constitute a public offer of securities in the Sultanate of Oman as contemplated by the Commercial Companies Law of Oman (Royal Decree 4/74) or the Capital Market Law of Oman (Royal Decree 80/98). This information is being circulated on a limited basis only to corporate entities that fall within the description of sophisticated investors (Article 139 of the Executive Regulations of the Capital Market Law). The recipient acknowledges that they are a sophisticated investor who has experience in business and financial matters and is capable of evaluating the merits and risks on an investment.; **South Africa** - This document has not been approved by the Financial Services Board and neither MFS International (U.K.) Limited nor its funds are registered for public sale in South Africa.; **UAE** - This document, and the information contained herein, does not constitute, and is not intended to constitute, a public offer of securities in the United Arab Emirates and accordingly should not be construed as such. The information is only being offered to a limited number of exempt investors in the UAE who fall under one of the following categories of non-natural Qualified Investors: (1) an investor which is able to manage its investments on its own, namely: (a) the federal government, local governments, government entities and authorities or companies wholly-owned by any such entities; (b) international entities and organisations; or (c) a person licensed to carry out a commercial activity in the UAE, provided that investment is one of the objects of such person; or (2) an investor who is represented by an investment manager licensed by the SCA, (each a "non-natural Qualified Investor"). The information and data have not been approved by or licensed or registered with the UAE Central Bank, the Securities and Commodities Authority, the Dubai Financial Services Authority, the Financial Services Regulatory Authority or any other relevant licensing authorities or governmental agencies in the UAE (the "Authorities"). The Authorities assume no liability for any investment that the named addressee makes as a non-natural Qualified Investor diligence on the accuracy of the information relating to the securities. If you do not understand the contents of this document you should consult an authorised financial adviser.; **Saudi Arabia** - This document may not be distributed in the Kingdom except to such persons as are permitted under the Investment Funds Regulations issued by the Capital Market Authority. The Capital Market Authority does not make any representation as to the accuracy or completeness of this document, and expressly disclaims any liability whatsoever for any loss arising from, or incurred in reliance upon, any part of this document. Prospective purchasers of the securities offered hereby should conduct their own due diligence on the accuracy of the information relating to the securities. If you do not understand the contents of this document, you should consult an authorised financial adviser.; **Qatar** - This material/fund is only being offered to a limited number of investors who are willing and able to conduct an independent investigation of the risks involved in an investment in such material/fund. The material does not constitute an offer to the public and is for the use only of the named addressee and should not be given or shown to any other person (other than employees, agents or consultants in connection with the addressee's consideration thereof). The fund has not been and will not be registered with the Qatar Central Bank or under any laws of the State of Qatar. No transaction will be concluded in your jurisdiction and any inquiries regarding the material/fund should be made to your contact outside Qatar.